

SUPPLEMENTARY SERVICE COST MEMO

The Alameda-Contra Costa Transit District (the District) provides basic, fixed-route bus service to most public and private junior high/middle schools and high schools within its service area using its regular route network. In addition, Supplementary Service trips are provided to meet the demand for increased system capacity at bell times. Resources – operating funds, vehicles, and bus operators – limit how much Supplementary Service can be offered. Pre-COVID, staff estimates the District provided 30,000 rides per day to students through a combination of regular fixed-route and Supplementary service.

STATE AND FEDERAL REGULATIONS

The District must comply with state and federal regulations when operating Supplementary Service. The District is prohibited from operating exclusive “school bus” service and may only supplement its existing route structure in order to provide needed capacity. Title 49 Code of Federal Regulations, Part 605 and Section 545 of the California Vehicle Code provide the authority under which the District operates Supplementary Service.

In part, these regulations and statutes require the District to publish all Supplementary Service schedules to notify the public that the service is available to all potential riders. Once schedule information is posted, the District cannot deviate from the published schedule without providing advance public notification. The District may operate Supplementary Service only over established routes or combined segments of established routes and serve only existing bus stops except for minor deviations. The District is expressly forbidden from customizing “school bus” service to provide home to school transportation.

BOARD POLICY 546 STANDARDS FOR OPERATION OF SUPPLEMENTARY SERVICE

Board Policy 546 provides operational standards for operating Supplementary Service. This includes the following details on coordination, capabilities, and deadlines:

- Staff is expected to coordinate with each school district and/or individual school and identify a single point-of-contact who can coordinate bell times and disseminate information.
- Each school district and school site are provided with specific information regarding the District’s capabilities and requirements.
- Schedule information for the following academic year shall be submitted no later than the second Monday in May for implementation in August at the start of the school year.

STANDARD PRACTICE FOR DROP-OFF/PICK-UP

Buses are generally scheduled to arrive at the bus stop closest to a school between 15 to 20 minutes prior to the start of school. In some cases, where there is a need to combine service to two different schools (e.g., Skyline High School and Montera Middle School), drop-off at a school may occur sooner than 20 minutes prior to the bell. Morning trips are more likely to be shared by students of multiple schools due to bell times for most schools being around the same time.

Afternoon trips are not generally shared by multiple schools. Buses typically arrive at a school five minutes prior to dismissal bell and leave between five and 10 minutes after the bell. However, a school may request that buses leave later to mitigate issues such as a large campus size that make it difficult for students to arrive at the bus stop on time.

EXISTING SUPPLEMENTARY SERVICE LEVELS (WINTER 2022)

Supplementary Service trips are coordinated with bell times at 38 schools (34 public schools and four private schools).

Public school districts that include schools served by Supplementary Service include Alameda Unified School District (AUSD), Fremont Unified School District (FUSD), Hayward Unified School District (HUSD), Oakland Unified School District (OUSD), Newark Unified School District (NUSD), San Lorenzo Unified School District (SLZUSD) and West Contra Costa Unified School District (WCCUSD).

Private schools that have Supplementary Service trips coordinated with bell times include Bishop O'Dowd High School (Lines 680 and 682), Head-Royce School (Lines 604, 605, 606), Oakland Hebrew Day School (Line 604) and St. Mary's High School (Line 688).

Daily Trips Operated

The District operates 157 Supplementary Service trips per weekday; 60 trips in the morning and 97 in the afternoon. Most of the Supplementary Service is dedicated to schools within OUSD.

Afternoon service is higher due to heavier ridership in the afternoons. It is likely that some students get dropped off by a parent/guardian in the morning and then take the bus home in the afternoon as the morning bells align better with traditional work schedules.

OUSD schools are served by 62 Supplementary trips per weekday. This includes 25 trips each morning and 37 trips each afternoon. Trips to OUSD schools account for over 39 percent of all Supplementary Service trips. It should be noted that over 80 percent of the Supplementary trips to OUSD schools (50 of 62) are serving three schools: Skyline High, Montera Middle and Rudsdale High.

Other school districts that are served by large number of Supplementary Service trips include WCCUSD (35) and FUSD (20). Exhibit 1 details the number of Supplementary trips provided within each school district.

Exhibit 1 – Supplementary Service Trips by School District

School Type	School District	# of Trips	% of Total Trips
Public	Alameda Unified	9	5.8%
	Fremont Unified	20	12.8%
	Hayward Unified	4	2.6%
	Newark Unified	8	5.1%
	Oakland Unified	61	39.1%
	San Lorenzo Unified	2	1.3%
	West Contra Costa Unified	35	22.4%
Private	N/A	17	10.9%
Total		156	100%

Platform Hours

Platform hours refer to the total scheduled time a bus spends from pull-out to pull-in to the operating garage. Supplementary Service utilizes nearly 208 platform hours per weekday. This includes nearly 72 hours in the morning and over 136 hours in the afternoon.

Over 65 percent of the platform hours for supplementary service occur in the afternoon. In addition to increased demand in the afternoon, these trips require more platform hours due to the staging time that occurs at each school prior to each trip.

It should be noted that over 40 percent of the platform hours allocated to Supplementary Service are on bus lines serving OUSD schools. Exhibit 2 details the number of platform hours allocated to Supplementary Service trips within each school district.

Exhibit 2 – Supplementary Service Platform Hours by School District

School Type	School District	# of Platform Hours	% of Total Platform Hours
Public	Alameda Unified	10.42	5.0%
	Fremont Unified	32.08	15.3%
	Hayward Unified	4.57	2.2%
	Newark Unified	11.32	5.4%
	Oakland Unified	84.78	40.5%
	San Lorenzo Unified	2.95	1.4%
	West Contra Costa Unified	40.12	19.2%
Private	N/A	23.07	11.0%
Total		209.28	100%

Early Release Trips

The District provides 54 additional Supplementary Service trips per week to schools that have a regularly occurring early release day (typically Wednesday). These trips total over 106 platform hours per week.

Required Vehicles

Operating the Supplementary Service trips requires 55 vehicles in the morning and 82 vehicles in the afternoon.

The higher vehicle count in the afternoon is mostly due to the higher number of Supplementary trips during that time period. In addition to requiring more vehicles in the afternoon due to the higher number of trips, Supplementary Service trips in OUSD are not typically interlined with each other in the afternoon, as bell schedules tend to be clustered around the same time (3:30 p.m.).

Exhibits 3 and 4 detail the number of buses required to provide Supplementary Service in the morning and afternoon, respectively.

Exhibit 3 – Morning Supplementary Service Buses Required by School District

School Type	School District	# of Buses	% of Total Buses
Public	Alameda Unified	4	7.3%
	Fremont Unified	6	10.9%
	Hayward Unified	0	0.0%
	Newark Unified	4	7.3%
	Oakland Unified	20	36.4%
	San Lorenzo Unified	1	1.8%
	West Contra Costa Unified	12	21.8%
Private	N/A	8	14.5%
Total		55	100%

Exhibit 4 – Afternoon Supplementary Service Buses Required by School District

School Type	School District	# of Buses	% of Total Buses
Public	Alameda Unified	5	6.1%
	Fremont Unified	9	11.0%
	Hayward Unified	3	3.7%
	Newark Unified	4	4.9%
	Oakland Unified	34	41.5%
	San Lorenzo Unified	1	1.2%
	West Contra Costa Unified	17	20.7%
Private	N/A	9	11.0%
Total		82	100%

SUPPLEMENTARY SERVICE TO OUSD SCHOOL SITES

The district provides Supplementary Service to six schools within OUSD- Bret Harte Middle School, Montera Middle, Oakland High, Oakland Technical High, Rudsdale High and Skyline High. Supplementary Service to these schools accounts for 39.5 percent (62 of 157) of all daily Supplementary Service trips and over 40 percent of the daily platform hours platform hours (84.79) generated by these trips. Exhibit 5 below details the number of trips and platform hours allocated to OUSD schools.

Exhibit 5 – Supplementary Service to OUSD Schools

School	Located	Trips	Platform Hours
Bret Harte Middle	Flats	1	1.20
Montera Middle	Hills	15	22.13
Oakland High	Flats	4	4.57
Oakland Technical High	Flats	7	9.62
Rudsdale High	Hills	4	5.25
Skyline High	Hills	31	42.02
TOTAL		62	84.79

Hill Schools

Schools located in the Oakland Hills have little to no access to all-day transit service. Skyline High is served once an hour by Line 39. Rudsdale High is served once an hour by Line 46L. Montera Middle School is not served by an all-day bus line. The nearest bus service is located along Mountain Boulevard near Snake Road (Line 33) and there is no accessible path to this location from the school.

Supplementary Service trips to these schools account for 31.8 percent of all daily Supplementary Service trips (50 of 157). These trips total 69.4 platform hours per weekday, which is over one-third of the total number of platform hours dedicated to supplementary service trips.

Historically, in order to use resources more efficiently, staff has coordinated with OUSD to make sure Skyline High School morning bell times are staggered from Montera Middle School's bell times, as well as a few other schools. This allows morning Supplementary Service trips to be combined to serve two schools, reducing the number of buses and operators required to provide the service.

STATE SENATE BILL 328 (SB 328) IMPACTS

State Senate Bill 328 (SB 328) was signed by Governor Newsom in 2019. Under this new law, California's middle schools are required to start class no earlier than 8:00 a.m. and high schools no earlier than 8:30 a.m. These guidelines went into effect starting July 2022.

The majority of schools that the District serves adjusted their bell schedules during the 2021-2022 school year, with OUSD adjusting their schedules at the start of the 2022-2023 school year. Staff implemented several service changes at the start of both school years to mitigate the impacts of those schedule changes.

For the 2022-2023 school year, staff was able to work with OUSD staff to move Montera Middle School's start time to 9:05 a.m. This allowed the District to continue to interline some of the trips that serve Skyline High and Montera Middle schools. Moving Skyline High School's bell schedule in isolation from 8:05 a.m. to 8:30 a.m. had the potential for major cost/resource impacts to the District, due to how bus service to Skyline High School is interlined with service to other schools.

Bell schedule coordination among schools within school districts has helped reduce the number of buses required to operate Supplementary Service. This has worked well for many years for service to OUSD schools. By having Skyline High School start earlier than other schools, buses serving Skyline can recirculate and operate a second Supplementary Service trip to another school.

Another way to operate efficiently is to serve multiple schools on a single trip. This has been done successfully with service to FUSD schools, as each morning trip serves both a junior high/middle school and high school. In anticipation of SB 328, WCCUSD decided to start the school day at the same time at most schools. The route structure used for service to FUSD schools had to be implemented for WCCUSD to reduce the resources required to provide Supplementary Service.

A comparison between Winter 2019 (pre-SB 328 related bell time changes) and Winter 2022 (post-SB 328) highlights the reduction in the number of interlines between school trips in the morning and an increase in interlines between school trips in the afternoon. Exhibit 6 details the number of "Supplementary trip to Supplementary trip" interlines during the morning for both Winter 2019 and Winter 2022.

Exhibit 6 – Supplementary Service Trip to Supplementary Service Trip Interlines (AM)

School District	2019	2022
OUSD	12	5
AUSD	0	0
FUSD	0	0
HUSD	0	0
NUSD	1	0
WCCUSD	4	0
SLUSD	N/A	0
PRIVATE	0	0
TOTAL	17	5

District-wide, the number of buses operating two school trips in the morning went down from 17 (Winter 2019) to five (Winter 2022). Within Oakland, the number decreased from 12 (Winter 2019) to five (Winter 2022). It is important to note that the District operated less morning trips in the Winter 2022 (55) compared to Winter 2019 (60).

In the afternoon, Supplementary trips can be interlined together before heading back to the bus yard or before continuing onto San Francisco to operate Transbay service. Exhibit 7 details the number of “Supplementary Service to Supplementary Service” interlines that occurred in the afternoon in both Winter 2019 and Winter 2022.

Exhibit 7 – Supplementary Service Trip to Supplementary Service Trip Interlines (PM)

School District	2019	2022
OUSD	0	2
AUSD	1	0
FUSD	2	5
HUSD	0	1
NUSD	0	0
WCCUSD	9	6
SLUSD	N/A	0
PRIVATE	0	0
TOTAL	12	14

There was an increase in the overall number of “Supplementary Service to Supplementary Service” interlines. More interline opportunities became available for lines serving FUSD due to having more separation between dismissal times among some of the middle/junior high schools and high schools. In WCCUSD, however, fewer interline opportunities are now available.

Overall, staff was able to mitigate increased resource needs due to SB 328 through line consolidations, line eliminations, trip eliminations, interlining and continued bell schedule coordination. Total platform

hours allocated to Supplementary Service trips was reduced from approximately 230 hours to 208 hours. The total number of Supplementary trips was also reduced from 166 to 157. The total buses required to provide Supplementary Service stayed consistent (137), with the morning service requiring seven more buses than Winter 2019 and the afternoon requiring seven fewer buses.

TRANSBAY SERVICE REDUCTIONS

Supplementary Service has historically been interlined with Transbay service in the afternoon. This is due to the afternoon peak Transbay service starting over an hour after most schools have already been dismissed. Interlining Supplementary Service trips with Transbay allows for buses and operator to work multiple trips – one or two school trips and then one or two Transbay trips. Scheduling these two service types together has been the most efficient use of a bus and bus operator.

With the onset of COVID-19 and subsequent changing of work schedules, many workers are no longer commuting into San Francisco. This has forced the District to significantly reduce the amount of Transbay service that is being provided.

The reduction in the amount of Transbay service being provided has an impact on how Supplementary Service is scheduled in the afternoon. In Winter 2019, 73 of 89 buses (82.0 percent) continued as a Transbay line. In Winter 2021, only 39 of 82 buses (47.5 percent) continued as a Transbay line. In addition, the number of buses that came out of the bus yard to operate a single Supplementary trip before going back to the bus yard increased from six (Winter 2019) to 31 (Winter 2021).

While the District has not increased the resources allocated to Supplementary Service, these trips now drive costs, instead of being added onto existing resources that were already being spent. A decision to maintain or eliminate a Supplementary Service trip in 2022 has a greater impact on the District than in 2019.

COST OF SUPPLEMENTARY SERVICE

Staff estimates that Supplementary Service costs the District approximately \$12.2 million per year to operate. This includes both regular and early release Supplementary Services.

Supplementary Service to OUSD schools is estimated cost \$5 million per year. Most of the costs (\$4.1 million) are attributed to serving Skyline High, Montera Middle and Rudsdale High.

COST REIMBURSEMENT

Starting in the 1996-1997 fiscal year, OUSD was provided with a \$2.5 million home-to-school transportation allowance in perpetuity, through the state. OUSD and the District entered a Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) that stated that if OUSD received this funding, they would pass this money along to the District to cover the cost of the Supplementary Service to the Oakland Hills.

OUSD provided the District with \$2.225 million in AB 2972 funds (the District also gave OUSD credit for purchasing \$275,000 in passes each year). This provided the \$2.5 million funding to match the cost of the Supplementary Service provided to serve schools in the Oakland Hills. The District continued to receive this funding until FY2017-2018. Below is a summary of the changes to funding since FY2017-2018.

- In FY 2017-2018, OUSD only provided the District with \$500,000 in AB 2972 funding. In order to continue the service, the District implemented service changes that reduced the cost of the service by approximately \$700,000. The remaining cost were covered by the \$275,000 transit pass credit, \$500,000 in Regional Measure 2 (RM2) Marketing funds and a \$525,000 contribution by the District. This structure remained in place in FY 2018-2019.
- From FY 2019-2020 through FY 2020-2021, OUSD no longer contributed \$500,000. Instead, the District received \$1 million through SB 856 (Budget Act 2018) to be used over two years.
- In FY 2020-2021, the District received an additional \$1 million through AB 74 (Budget Act 2019) to use over two years.
- Last year (FY 2021-2022), Oakland contributed \$500,000 while the Metropolitan Transportation Commission (MTC) contributed \$325,000 in RM2 Marketing funds. Including the transit pass credit, total funding for the service was around \$1.6 million.
- This year (FY 2022-2023) MTC provided \$300,000 in RM2 Marketing funds. However, they informed the District that this is the last year of the subsidy. OUSD has not yet informed the District if they will be able to provide any funding for this year.

While the \$2.5 million funding that the District started receiving in FY 1996-1997 remained stagnant or was in jeopardy, costs to operate the service have continued to escalate every year, increasing by more than 1.6 times what it was in 1996 (\$4.1 million).