

Attachment 2: Contract Scenarios and Cost Estimates for Transit Shelter Contract

Contract Scenario Maintenance and Capital Costs Per Year

Scenario	Total In-House Staff	Maintenance Costs	Capital Costs	Total First Year Costs
Scenario A* -- Existing contract structure, where all services are outsourced to a single contractor.	0	\$0	\$0	\$0
Scenario B AC Transit -- Shelter Ownership Contractor 1 – Maintenance Contractor 2 – Advertising, Installations, Relocations,	3	\$2,905,937	\$315,000	\$ 3,220,937
Scenario C AC Transit -- Shelter Ownership Contractor 1 – Maintenance Contractor 2 – Advertising Contractor 3 – Installations, Relocations	3	\$3,230,493	\$395,000	\$ 3,625,493
Scenario D AC Transit – Maintenance, Ownership Contractor 1 – Advertising Contractor 2 – Repairs, Installations, and Relocations	23	\$4,460,886	\$1,285,000	\$ 5,745,886
Scenario E AC Transit – Maintenance, Repairs, Installations, Relocations, Utility Costs, Permits, Ownership, etc. Contractor 1 – Advertising	28	\$5,022,382	\$1,400,000	\$ 6,422,382
Scenario F Removal of all shelters by a contractor, including construction repairs, labor, and permits	1	\$0	\$405,000	\$405,000

* Under Scenario A, AC Transit made approximately 180k in administrative fees in 2019. Clear Channel Outdoor Advertising, the current contractor, made approximately 940k in advertising revenue in 2019. CCO used the advertising revenue to offset maintenance costs which totaled approximately 700k in 2019. Clear Channel Outdoor is no longer interested in continuing with this existing contract structure because most advertising revenue has moved online. Therefore, Scenario A is no longer an option.

Bus Stop Furniture Totals

Jurisdiction	Kiosk	Non Ad Shelter	Transit Shelter	Grand Total	Map Cases	Power
Alameda						
Unincorporated			21	21	9	
Albany			9	9	9	2
Berkeley		5	46	51	44	9
El Cerrito	1	5		6	6	
Fremont			49	49	45	9
Hayward		11	52	63	56	2
Newark		2	13	15	14	
Richmond	2	3	4	9	4	3
San Leandro	2	5	30	37	32	1
San Pablo		1	9	10	9	3
Grand Total	5	32	233	270	228	29

Assumptions

Task	Time	Frequency
Cleaning	Weekly (52)	2
Pressure Wash	Monthly (12)	1
Map Changes	Quarterly (4)	1

Bus Shelter Installations, Removals, Repairs

* These costs represent first year costs. Costs may change due to inflation.

* Includes shelter purchase, concrete work, permitting, and labor costs.

Units	# of Units	Unit Cost	Cost Per Year
Shelter Removals	10	\$1,500	\$15,000
Shelter Installation - New Shelter	10	\$20,000	\$200,000
Shelter Installation - Repaired Shelter	10	\$10,000	\$100,000
TOTAL COST (Removals + Installations + Repairs)			\$315,000

* These costs represent a one time cost for shelter removal

Units	# of Units	Unit Cost	One Time Cost
Shelter Removal - ALL	270	\$1,500	\$405,000

Capital Costs (First Year)

Scenario	Installations, Relocations, Removals	Maintenance Vehicles	Work Space	TOTAL
Scenario A	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
Scenario B	\$315,000	\$0	\$0	\$315,000
Scenario C	\$315,000	\$80,000	\$0	\$395,000
Scenario D	\$315,000	\$880,000	\$90,000	\$1,285,000
Scenario E	\$315,000	\$995,000	\$90,000	\$1,400,000
	Includes shelter purchase, concrete work, permitting, and labor costs. New shelters may be installed or moved due to construction.	Total cost to purchase vehicles for in-house work. For vehicle operating costs see "Annual Operating Costs: Maintenance, Repairs, Staff"	Space for storing shelters, repair parts, etc.	Total Capital Costs

Annual Operating Costs: Maintenance

Maintenance													
Scenario	Number of Shelters (JPA Only)	Powerwashing Washing (monthly)		Graffiti Removal (per hour)		Trash, Sweeping, and Cleaning (weekly)		Cleaning Materials	Vehicle Maintenance	Real-Time Signage Installs		Map and Schedule Updates (Quarterly)	
		Cost	Staff	Cost	Staff	Cost	Staff			Cost	Staff	Salary + Materials	Staff
Scenario A	241	\$0	Contracted out	\$0	Contracted out	\$0	Contracted out	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
Scenario B	241	\$867,600	Contracted out	\$394,559	Contracted out	\$1,002,560	Contracted out	\$0	\$30,000	\$0	Contracted out	\$56,480	Contracted out
Scenario C	241	\$867,600		\$394,559	Contracted out	\$1,002,560	Contracted out	\$0	\$30,000	\$0	Contracted out	\$56,480	Contracted out
Explanation for Scenarios B - C	Total number of shelters for local jurisdictions in the Joint Powers Agreement	Total shelters x Avg BRT Platform Power Washings x \$200/shelter = Annual Powerwashing Costs		Total shelters x Avg BRT Platform Graffiti Cleanings x \$170/shelter = Annual Graffiti Removal Costs		Total shelters x 2x per week cleaning frequency x total cleanings per year x \$40/shelter = Annual Cleaning Costs (Trash, Sweeping, Light Graffiti, Etc)		No cost to the District, Contractor expected to have its own cleaning materials	No cost to the District, Contractor expected to have its own vehicles	Separate Contract. Costs not included.		\$20,000 for the District to print out public information (maps, schedules, holidays, etc). Labor Costs: Total Shelters x 4 quarterly installations x \$40/shelter with a map case	

Annual Operating Costs: Maintenance (continued)

Maintenance													
Scenario	Number of Shelters (JPA Only)	Powerwashing Washing (monthly)		Graffiti Removal (per hour)		Trash, Sweeping, and Cleaning (weekly)		Cleaning Materials	Vehicle Maintenance	Real-Time Signage Installs		Map and Schedule Updates (Quarterly)	
		Cost	Staff	Cost	Staff	Cost	Staff			Cost	Staff	Salary + Materials	Staff
Scenario D	241	\$1,216,576	8 BSMW	\$304,144	2 BSMW	\$1,216,576	8 BSMW	\$50,000	\$318,000	\$0	Contracted out	\$324,144	2 BSMW
Scenario E	241	\$1,216,576	8 BSMW	\$304,144	2 BSMW	\$1,216,576	8 BSMW	\$50,000	\$358,000	\$0	\$0	\$324,144	2 BSMW
Explanation for Scenarios D - E	Total number of shelters for local jurisdictions in the Joint Powers Agreement	Pressure washing (1) once a month 4 hrs per location x total shelters x 12 months= 13,248 hrs 13,248 hrs / 1,720 actual labor hrs per year per employee = 7.7 employees. rounded up to 8 employees		1 labor hour per shelter per month 1 hr per month x Total shelters x 12 months = 3,312 labor hours per year 3,312 labor hours per year / 1,720 actual labour hours per year per employee = 1.925 employees. Rounded up to 2 employees		Total shelters x 2x per week cleaning frequency x total cleanings per year x \$17/shelter = Annual Cleaning Costs (Trash, Sweeping, Light Graffiti, Etc)		Estimate amount of cleaning materials needed.	Estimated Vehicle Maintenance needed.	Separate Contract. Costs not included.		Staff to change maps, schedules, and fares once a quarter and on an on-call basis due to damages + \$20,000 for the District to print out public information (maps, schedules, holidays, etc)	

Annual Operating Costs: Repairs and Staffing

	Repairs					Staffing						
Scenario	Electrical: PG&E + Repairs		Mechanical Repairs		Glass Repairs	Contract Inspections and		Supervision (Shelter Maintenance)		Assistant Facilities Manager	Total Staff	Total Cost to the District (Annual - Maintenance, Repairs, & Staffing)
	Salary + Materials	Staff	Salary + Materials	Staff		Cost	Staff	Salary	Staff			
Scenario A	\$0	Contracted Out	\$0	Contracted Out	\$0	\$0	N/A	\$0	Contracted out	N/A	No dedicated staff in the current scenario	\$0
Scenario B	\$0	Contracted Out	\$0	Contracted Out	\$0	\$304,144	2 BSMW	\$0	Contracted out	\$250,594	1 Assistant Facilities Manager Position 2 Bus Stop Maintenance Workers TOTAL: 3 Staff	\$2,351,198.91
Scenario C	\$10,208	Contracted Out	\$209,565	Contracted Out	\$104,783	\$304,144	2 BSMW	\$0	Contracted out	\$250,594	1 Assistant Facilities Manager Position 2 Bus Stop Maintenance Workers TOTAL: 3 Staff	\$2,351,198.91
Explanation for Scenarios B - C	Avg cost per BRT Platform (\$100) x PG&E Bill (\$21/mo) x Total Shelters = Annual Electrical Repairs		Avg cost per BRT Platform (\$869.60) x Total Shelters = Annual Electrical Repairs		Avg cost per BRT Platform (\$434.8) x Total Shelters = Annual Glass Repairs	Two Bus Stop Maintenance Workers to help install public information (maps, schedules, fares) and monitor the contract via field checks.		No Staff Needed		Manages the contract for compliance.	Total internal staff needed to manage the transit shelter contract and monitor the contract	Total Cost to the District (Annual)

Annual Operating Costs: Repairs and Staffing (continued)

Annual Operating Costs: Repairs and Staffing (continued)												
Scenario	Repairs					Staffing						Total Cost to the District (Annual - Maintenance, Repairs, & Staffing)
	Electrical: PG&E + Repairs		Mechanical Repairs		Glass Repairs	Contract Inspections and		Supervision (Shelter Maintenance)		Assistant Facilities Manager	Total Staff	
	Salary + Materials	Staff	Salary + Materials	Staff		Cost	Staff	Salary	Staff			
Scenario D	\$10,208	Contracted Out	\$209,565	Contracted Out	\$104,783	\$0	No need for contract monitoring because functions are in-house	\$456,296	2 BSMW	\$250,594	1 Assistant Facilities Manager Position 20 BSMW for in-house shelter cleaning 2 BSMW Supervisor TOTAL: 23 Staff	\$3,429,440.00
Scenario E	\$181,792	1 Electrician	\$559,477	2 Facilities Mechanics	\$104,783	\$0		\$456,296	2 BSMW	\$250,594	1 Assistant Facilities Manager Position 20 BSMW for in-house cleanings and map replacements 2 BSMW Supervisor 2 Facilities Mechanics 1 Electricians TOTAL: 26 Staff	\$3,469,440.00
Explanation for Scenarios D - E	1 Electrician assigned to all shelters for routine Inspections, repairs, and modifications.		2 Facilities Mechanics to perform inspections, perform repairs, repair glass, relocations and removal of shelters. 2 Fac. Mechanics = \$319,477. \$240,000 added for hardware materials for mechanical repairs.		Avg cost per BRT Platform (\$434.8) x Total Shelters = Annual Glass Repairs	No need for contract monitoring because functions are in-house		Bus Stop Maintenance Workers to supervise the maintenance of shelters in the field		Manages the contract for compliance.	Total internal staff needed to manage the transit shelter contract and monitor the contract	Total Cost to the District (Annual)

Bench Analysis

- * Assumes all existing shelters (270) will be replaced by benches and conforms with ADA
- * Costs could change depending on in-house or contractor models
- * Assumes 1x cleaning per week per bench
- * Estimates may change based on inflation

Estimate	Cost per bench	Shipping	Quantity	Spares	Installation cost per bench (est 20% cost)	Capital Expenditure	Capital and Installation Cost	Annual Maintenance (est \$40 each bench)	First Year Implementation (estimated)
High	\$2,000	\$150	270	10	\$400	\$602,000	\$714,000	\$582,400	\$1,296,400
Medium	\$1,700	\$150	270	10	\$340	\$518,000	\$613,200	\$582,400	\$1,195,600
Low	\$1,250	\$150	270	10	\$250	\$392,000	\$462,000	\$582,400	\$1,044,400