

Attachment 3
Peer Review of Bus Stop and Bus Shelter Contract Structures

Agency/Jurisdiction	Current Contracting Structure		
	Full Service Contract (Type 1A): Outsourced All Services to a Third Party Contractor		
Agency/Jurisdiction	AC Transit 1999 Contract + 7th Amendment (Through June 30, 2021)	AC Transit New Bridge Contract (Under Negotiation - July 1, 2021 to December 31, 2021)	AC Transit Future Contract (TBD - 5 year with two 5 year options to extend)
Contract Administrator	AC Transit	AC Transit	AC Transit
Vendor	Clear Channel Outdoors	Clear Channel Outdoors	Awarded to Clear Channel Outdoor
Existing Shelters	266	383	383
Number of Contracts	1	1	1

Agency/Jurisdiction	AC Transit	AC Transit	AC Transit
Trash Pick Up, Graffiti Cleaning, Broken Glass, Power Washing,	CCO	CCO	CCO
Electrical Repairs	CCO	CCO	CCO
Bus Service Information (Maps, Fares, Etc.)	CCO	CCO	CCO
Advertisements	CCO	CCO	CCO
Shelter Relocations	within 5 days of getting the permit	within 5 days of getting the permit	within 5 days of getting the permit
New Shelters (Fabricate, Permitting, Installations)	CCO	CCO	CCO

Agency/Jurisdiction	AC Transit	AC Transit	AC Transit
Maintenance Frequency	1 to 2 times a week	1 to 2 times a week	1 to 2 times a week
Response Time	24 hours	24 hours	24 hours
Documentation	Monthly Maintenance Logs with Photos	Monthly Maintenance Logs with Photos	Monthly Maintenance Logs with Photos

Agency/Jurisdiction	AC Transit	AC Transit	AC Transit
Staff	5 (Contractor)	5 (Contractor)	Based on Cost Proposal (estimated 5 to 8)
Admin Fee to AC Transit	N/A	N/A	\$183K
Capital Costs to AC Transit	\$0	\$0	\$0
Maintenance Cost to AC Transit	\$0	\$0	\$0
Revenues to JPA	\$0	\$0	\$0
Revenues to AC Transit	\$0	\$0	\$0
Total Cost To AC Transit	\$0.0M	TBD	N/A

Key Takeaways

- By separating the maintenance contracts from advertising contracts, maintenance at bus stops is no longer tied to the amount of advertising revenue generated. Both the City of Phoenix (Full Service) and Metro Transit (Hybrid Services) take this approach and have consistent reporting methods and cleanings at their bus shelters and stops as a result.
- All agencies had third-party advertising contracts with a Minimum Annual Guarantee (MAG) and all agencies used the MAG revenues to help offset maintenance and capital costs.
- Some of these agencies had contracts that covered not only bus shelters, but bus stops broadly. For example, the City of Phoenix Department of Transit's maintenance contract covers basic maintenance cleaning for all their bus stops and transit centers. Operating under AC Transit's current contract model means that only bus stops with shelters are maintained on a consistent basis (with the exception of Tempo Bus Rapid Transit (BRT)).

Agency/Jurisdiction	Alternate Contracting Structures		
	Full Service Contract (Type 1B): Outsourced All Services to a Third Party Contractor, Three Separate Contracts	Hybrid Service (Type 2A): Outsource some services to a third-party contractor, while taking capital cost of shelters in-house.	Hybrid Service (Type 2B): Outsource advertising services to a third-party contractor, while taking maintenance in-house.
Agency/Jurisdiction	City of Phoenix, AZ Department of Transit	Valley Transportation Authority	Metro Transit, Minneapolis St. Paul
Contract Administrator	City of Phoenix, AZ Department of Transit	VTA	AC Transit
Vendor	1. Lamar Outdoor Advertising 2. Graffiti Protective Coatings, Inc. 3. TALIS Construction Corp	Clear Channel Outdoors	Intersection
Existing Shelters	2,000	594	1,000
Number of Contracts	3	1	1

Agency/Jurisdiction	City of Phoenix, AZ Department of Transit	Valley Transportation Authority	Metro Transit, Minneapolis St. Paul
Trash Pick Up, Graffiti Cleaning, Broken Glass, Power Washing,	Graffiti Protective Coatings, Inc.	CCO	Metro Transit (Intersection helps with some basic cleanup when needed)
Electrical Repairs	Graffiti Protective Coatings, Inc.	CCO	Metro Transit
Bus Service Information (Maps, Fares, Etc.)	Graffiti Protective Coatings, Inc.	CCO	Metro Transit
Advertisements	Lamar Outdoor Advertising (Includes Bus Wraps and On-Board Ads)	CCO	Intersection
Shelter Relocations	TALIS Construction Corp (including storing shelters and other bus furniture, concrete work)	CCO	Metro Transit
New Shelters (Fabricate, permit, install)	TALIS Construction Corp (including storing shelters and other bus furniture, concrete work)	At VTA's sole cost, VTA may add new shelters. VTA must also purchase their own replacement parts.	As needed, at Metro Transit's sole cost

Agency/Jurisdiction	City of Phoenix, AZ Department of Transit	Valley Transportation Authority	Metro Transit, Minneapolis St. Paul
Maintenance Frequency	1 to 5 times a week	1 to 2 times a week	1 every two weeks
Response Time	24 hours	24 hours	24 hours
Documentation	Weekly Maintenance Logs and Work Schedule Construction Schedules with Updates/Changes sent within 24 hours	Monthly Maintenance Logs with Photos	In House Work Order System

Agency/Jurisdiction	City of Phoenix, AZ Department of Transit	Valley Transportation Authority	Metro Transit, Minneapolis St. Paul
Staff	1. Lamar Outdoor Advertising: N/A 2. Graffiti Protective Coatings, Inc: 5 3. TALIS Construction Corp: On-Call Varies by Service	5 (Contractor)	18 In-House Staff For Bus Shelters (80 - 100 bus shelters per staff)
Admin Fee to Agency	N/A	N/A	N/A
Capital Costs to Agency	(\$2.25M)	(\$0.2M)	(\$3.0M)
Maintenance Cost to Agency	(\$1.75M)	N/A	(\$1.0M)
Revenues to JPA	\$0	(\$0.3M)	N/A
Revenues to Agency	\$2.0M (MAG to City)	\$0.5M (MAG to VTA)	\$5.0M (MAG to Metro)
Total Cost To Agency	(\$2.0M)	\$0.0M	\$1.0M